Commissioner Frangella: Next item is 2019-6-SPU requested by Kenneth Martin, Jr. for four townhouse units at 10990 River Road, St. Rose. Zoning District CR-1. Council District 5.Mr. Welker.

Mr. Welker: The request is a special permit for a four (4) unit townhouse units located at the site that is zoned CR-1, Residential/Commercial Transitional, in this zoning district any proposed residential dwellings need to go through this special process in order for this to be done.

The proposed use meets the majority of the evaluation criteria for a special permit use and the submitted site plan meets the requirements for townhouse developments.

The buildings have been positioned in order to accommodate a 15 foot drainage servitude at the request of Public Works to lessen the drainage impact this development may have to the business abutting to the rear. Public Works has also stated this development will required a drainage impact analysis. If approved, the DIA must be submitted and reviewed during the permitting stage.

Townhouse developments must go through the subdivision process in order to locate each unit on its own individual townhouse lot. This will require a minor subdivision approval from the Planning Commission if this is able to move forward. The department does recommend approval.

Commissioner Frangella: Alright is the applicant present to speak? Step up to the mic, state your name and address please.

Kenneth Martin, PO Box 11, Kenner, LA. I wanted to if I can put the picture on the easel to make sure that everybody can clearly see it. Because once everybody clearly see the plans and not say that they haven't seen it. I just want to say quickly, I'm not going to keep you long, it's evident that's a beautiful piece that we're bringing, we have another real estate agent that will come up and show another piece that we have in the area that far exceeds the appraisal of the surrounding area. Before we bought the property, the property was available for a year, just sitting with cars on them, you'll see the pictures with cars just sitting on it since 2015, it's just been accommodating cars. That's all I have to say.

Commissioner Frangella: That's all you have to say?

Mr. Martin: That's all I have to say.

Commissioner Frangella: Anyone else?

Hello I'm DeAndray Martin, I'm the developer and builder for River View Park that will be located at 10990 River Road. I just wanted to present this to you that River View Park is a beautiful development of luxury townhouses that will increase the value of this particular area. It has been an eyesore for many years and I wanted to provide home ownership at an affordable price. Also it will actually have taxpayers, these are homeowners, not renters, not subsidized housing and this will actually reinvest into the city and the parish with the home ownership and the tax credits and the tax dollars. So I wanted to let them know it will not decrease the value of their homes, it actually will increase the property value and I actually have a real estate agent here to confirm that so can she please come up right now?

Commissioner Frangella: Does she have to wait until it's open?

Mr. Albert: If it's part of the applicant's presentation she can come up now.

Commissioner Frangella: Please state your name and address for the record.

Angel Doublet, 102 Oaklawn Ridge Lane, St. Rose, La. I actually have sold one of their properties in St. Rose and it's a beautiful piece. I think the property will add value to the neighborhood and it's going to add more inventory that we're needing in St. Charles

Parish because I do show a lot of houses to people like in Kenner and Metairie who want to come to St. Charles Parish but when it comes to put in an offer they're gone so quickly because we don't have enough inventory here. And the fact that they are going to be pricing them in the middle \$250 range is a great idea. It's going to be new construction and it's going to add value to that neighborhood. It's probably going to motivate more people to add more value to their houses. It's beautiful and yes I have driven by that lot and it's been vacant for a while and people are parking on that land, that's all I have to say.

Commissioner Frangella: Thank you.

Ms. Martin: So I'm in favor of bringing a beautiful, luxury development to St. Rose. Thank you.

Commissioner Frangella: Thank you ma'am. Alright I'll open the public hearing for 2019-6-SPU, anyone here to speak for or against? State your name and address.

Good afternoon ladies and gentlemen. My name is Jay Smith I live at 90 Riverview Drive. I have a question to ask, why are we here again after the first meeting failed on April 4th? Now we are wasting tax payers money, so this is how this works, he keeps filing until you say yes? Why would Planning & Zoning even ponder the thought of putting townhomes in a residential, single dwelling neighborhood? When we built our homes we had to build according to the rest of the homes in the neighborhood, so what changed? We live in a single family community, not a townhome community. These townhomes will take away from the integrity of the neighborhood and bring issues we don't need. Property, no matter what people say, townhomes are like cars, they lose value after a few years and by putting people in there, their first home, they don't stay in these things, they move on. Whoever moves in next, they don't care. We're talking about drainage problems, so there won't be no drainage problems? That's a maybe, that's nothing that's been singing, shouting or nothing about and it would probably deter people from buying homes down my street because they don't want to live around townhomes. None of the other neighborhoods are having to deal with this issue, we don't want it either. I believe you should leave the property in question as it's zoned today and stop the special permit to put townhomes in our neighborhood. Mr. Martin has mentioned about the homes he's building in surrounding subdivisions, so why cause so much tension to someone that don't want it in their neighborhood. Do the right thing and build your home in our neighborhood like the rest Mr. Martin. You think you have the right to come into our neighborhood and change the footprint and to line your pockets. There was once a house that sat on that same lot that these folks are talking about, that Mr. Martin purchased, that sat there for over 120 years until it was taken down about 1-1/2 ago and brought to Destrehan. The previous owners were going to build on that property, build a home, not a townhouse, a home but they had a tragedy in their family, so they took over their family home and the property. When does this stop? I mean Planning and Zoning has made some bad choices in the past, let's not make one today. Please vote this permit down again today and show the community that you are working for the community and that you are listening to us and if Mr. Martin really cared about the community, he would stop with these townhomes and build his house, not townhomes, homes on the vacant lot. Thank you ladies and gentlemen.

## Audience applause

Good evening, I'm Elaine Rounds, I live at 93 Riverview Drive, the property abutting the property in question for the zoning change. We strongly object to the zoning as it will impact our way of life. Firstly, we're worried about the drainage problem. When they built Family Dollar they took away our drainage ditch, when it rains heavy like it did today, Family Dollar's parking lot floods, when it rains a lot it comes up to the curb, when it rains a whole lot it spills over the curb and it's in my back yard. Where is all this water going to go with these townhouses because it's going to be mostly cement and most of the grass will be gone. Our street slopes also to the north and would the runoff also have an affect on the houses on a lower level than ours. Secondly, having townhouses adjacent to my property will leave us with about 8 ft. of easement between our home and the first townhome. This will not give us any privacy because the upstairs

windows can look down on our bedrooms and also our back yard even though we have a privacy fence. Also it will completely take away our view of the levee and watching the ships go by. Also it would obstruct our solar panels to the south and that's where most of our solar panels are and that would really hurt us a lot because they do work. Thirdly, our street Riverview Drive is and has been purely residential single family homes, we're also a dead end street which enhances the neighborhood feel, we feel this needs to continue and townhomes don't meet the criteria of the neighborhood. We believe the townhouses will decrease in value and possibly increase the crime rate in the area. When they built my home 30 years ago my kitchen cabinets were stolen out of my house before they had a chance to put them up. Lastly we were very unhappy when we had the Family Dollar moving in back of us. We had to deal with boom box cars, trash and other related problems that come with commercial property. Townhouses are not truly residential properties, they can turn into a transient area I used to live in, in Kenner, that is why we had our home built in 1988, we got away from that type of neighborhood, now our quiet peaceful neighborhood is being threatened with the same type of thing we moved away from. Our street, Riverview Drive does not need this eyesore in our community. Thank you.

Audience applause

Commissioner Frangella: Order.

Sabrine Neathamer, 124 Riverview Drive. I just moved in the neighborhood, it's a single home residence, I didn't look for a townhome in the area. I feel like I have 5 children and this is not the property for it. It's just a single residence where I feel comfortable. Looking at a townhome on the corner, it's going to make me leave my street. I'm here with the rest of my people that live on my block, whatever they say I agree with. Thank you.

Audience applause Commissioner Frangella: Order

Good evening my name is Tim Kelly, I live at 92 Riverview in St. Rose. Unfortunately I was unable to attend last meeting, last month when the permit was declined, but it was stated on the announcement that we got that we were able to submit in writing our agreement or opposition of it. I asked my sister who lives 2 houses down from me if she got any notification of what they planned on doing in the neighborhood and she said no. So I spoke to my neighbor and this was Saturday when we got the registered letter, the next day was Sunday so I said I'm going to go to the neighborhood and everybody be informed on what they plan on doing at the beginning because this affects the neighborhood, just not the houses around it, the people are going to go back and forth in front of this structure if it's built, so it's going to affect everybody that lives on the street. So I got a petition signed from approximately 75 people in the neighborhood that were home that Sunday. Every person we went to was opposed of it. There may have been 1 person that didn't sign. I watched the meeting that night, I wasn't able to attend, I sent copies of the petition to Chris Welker and the Parish President and I asked this board to bring it up for the meeting to put it in the record, it wasn't, nobody mentioned anything about the petition until my neighbor brought it up. Now that kind of got me upset because I put my trust in yall in doing this. In the early 80's when my family was looking for property to build our homes to and we came across the vacant land at the beginning of Riverview Estates, it was a perfect setting, it was a rural atmosphere, it was like a big park with trees, we decided to purchase the property, my parents, my grandmother and myself, we had country lots. Since then my parents passed away in the home that they built and my wife and I plan on doing the same thing, we plan on living in St. Charles for the rest of our lives. We invested our money and half of our lives in to our home and to have these large structures built across from our home, it takes away from our quality of life that we invested our life into. The structures would be out of place with the surrounding sites like everybody else is saying, it's a single dwelling area, it would bring a negative impact to everyone in the neighborhood because the majority of the people are against it. They mentioned about the property values, if you do an internet search which I'm sure he does, you'll come up with the majority of the sites stating that townhomes are usually a little bit lower than a single family homes and they

appreciate at a much slower rate than a home does and it says that in time townhomes would even loose value. So it does make sense that in time these will depreciate the surrounding neighborhood if these are valued at a lower price, then it's going to bring the value of our home down. They've also mentioned in this flyer, I'll get to that, that they're going to be sold, well true, they'll be sold at the beginning but who's to say that the people that buy it are going to live there, they can buy it as an investment and rent it to people so we have no say who's living there and if they're going to take care of the property, that's another concern. Another thing is why didn't Mr. Martin approach the neighbors that are in the surrounding area beside it to come up with this idea to get a feel if anybody was for it or against it. Another question I wanted to ask, after having strong opposition we have signs down the street opposing this, after the last meeting when the permit was denied, Mr. Martin didn't purchase the property until a week after it was denied, why did he go through with the sale of the property when there's so much opposition of building these structures. Also just the other day some of our neighbors in the neighborhood received letters announcing the construction of these buildings, these structures, it was written out on May 27th, this was even before we came to the meeting tonight so how did they get the cart before the horse saying oh yeah, we're going to build it. This has to be voted on before they can do this and I got the flyer right here and the letter they sent to everybody. The main thing that we're here for is the zoning. The parish has these properties zoned as CR-1, everybody knows 1 means only 1 structure so he has to get a special permit and a special permit if you look up special permit what the meaning is, just brief, it says a special permit is granted to a landowner if the Zoning Commission in a public forum agree and the community does not object to the proposed development. Well we're standing here today with over 75 people that's opposing this, so that doesn't fit the criteria for a special permit. Not only is the community against it, the Parish President, he's against it and from what I understand the Councilwoman from our district is against it, so I'm here tonight to ask yall to do the right thing, stand behind the homeowners of Riverview Estates and make the final decision and deny this permit again. Thank you for hearing me.

Audience applause.

Commissioner Frangella: Anyone else to speak for or against?

My name is Paul Mandella, I live at 139 Riverview Drive, St. Rose and like a lot of the people in our neighborhood that has been residents there for several years, I've been a resident for 35 years at 139 St. Rose [Riverview]. I firmly believe like these people are saying and I've had some long standing issues in my neighborhood already and I really believe the development of this project will further those issues. Like I said I've been here 35 years. I bought it, it was a nice quiet neighborhood and I think the development of this is not going to be to the advantage of the people in our neighborhoods. So I just wanted to mention that.

Charles Bailey, 88 Riverview. I oppose to these townhomes and if you just listen to what we got to say, we'd appreciate it. Thank you.

Audience applause.

Commissioner Frangella: Order

Karen Catalanato, 88 Riverview Dr., St. Rose. And we've been through this all before. I just want to reiterate everything my neighbors said, we all feel the same way. These townhomes will ruin the integrity of the neighborhood. I think above all it's value, we've all invested 30+ years of our lives and our property, in the neighborhood and in this parish. I'm sorry, I'm emotional, this is a real kick in the gut if this passes. So I am respectfully asking every one of yall to put yourselves in our position, see it through our eyes and please do not pass this. Thank you.

Audience applause.

Good evening ladies and gentlemen my name is Pamela Courville. I live at 86 Riverview Drive, right at the front, the second house. When I back out in the mornings I have to

back out very slowly already for traffic so if they would build these townhouses, the traffic would be horrible. I duly oppose to this and please vote our way. Thank you.

Audience applause.

Commissioner Frangella: Order

Good evening, my name is Bruno Sandoval, I live at 135 Riverview and I definitely oppose to this. I strongly believe everything my neighbors says and really don't see no place for those things, it's not going to look good and everything is going to be trouble for us. Thank you.

Audience applause.

Commissioner Frangella: Order

Yes, Carlene Banister, 200 Riverview Dr., St. Rose, La. I live at the cut through street down right and center. When we purchased this house, it was a dream come true and that was in '84. We have horses on the other side of our lot and it was awesome because my son got to actually work at a barn and now he's a trainer in Folsom, La and I'm an equine massage therapist because just being able to be in a country living. We leave the city, when you get on 310, that temperature drops, when you're on 310 going through that swamp seeing all of the cypress trees in the swamp and you can feel all the street leave you coming into St. Charles Parish, the parish that we love. We live here, we love it, we love St. Charles Parish, we love the country atmosphere. It was originally, our subdivision was originally a pecan farm. There were pecan trees there forever and unfortunately they don't live long, you have to take them down, but I have lots of pecan nuts if yall want some trees, I got a bunch of them. At this point you take a townhome, I lived in Kenner, in actual apartments, this to me is apartments that maybe people are purchasing at a higher dollar. I've been in Riverview Drive, the oil industry went down, I lost my job, the property value went down and then everybody started moving in because they lowered the price which is ok, it's fine, I love my neighbors. At this point when I look at this, this is beautiful, very nice, very nice. I like how they made the green lawn come a little further, well that's actually the street if I'm not mistaken if I look at the survey, that's the street actually where the landscaping section is back here, that's where the street is, if they have a backyard for this place, that thing is going to be on the street, ok. All of my neighbors that are up front, they have one car that maybe parked on the street and these guys are going to have four? If they have two people per dwelling that are working, that's eight cars. Not to mention we aren't going anywhere, we're established families with children, my son is now 41 years old and grandchildren. So this place goes, he goes ahead and gets his money, he goes ahead and sells it to somebody else then they have some type of tragedy then this one moves and that one moves and they lower the price, lower the price, now we're getting people in there, we have established families, we have grandchildren, transients coming in which may not be, may not happen but then you're talking about sexual abusers, you're talking about who these people are, you don't know who these people are that are moving in. We know who our neighbors are right now and we have to keep an eye on it because we live in 2019, no matter where you are you have to keep an eye on it. So at this point, this is our street, Riverview Estates when I moved in, that's what it was called, Riverview Estates. When I drove down that street and I saw those pecan trees I was like I'm not in the city, I look at that and I see city. I'm not doing city, we are not doing city. Come up with something different, put a park there, we need a park for our babies and for our dogs, that's what we need. We don't need four townhouses not even two, it was a single residence. You cannot make a single residence and then do four residences in one little bitty piece of property next to people that sitting right here and they're going to lose their privacy. You ever had a two story looking onto you? Well I got Charlestown looking down the back of my aisle with their townhouses. I can't do anything like that, I walk out into the backyard, there's a window, I don't know who lives there but they can see everything in my backyard. So I can't even imagine what they would be going through. How about this, why don't I pull up and get a piece of property next to your house and go ahead and put a four plex townhouse next to you with two

stories to where I can look in your backyard, see if you're not going to be here protesting against it. Thank you.

Good afternoon my name is Vicki Smith and I live at 90 Riverview Drive. I have lived in the neighborhood with my husband for 30 years, we built our home here, we raised our kids here, they went to the schools, we paid our taxes, I also work in the parish. I've been working in the parish for 27 years. And now Mr. Martin wants to come in our neighborhood and put townhomes. Townhomes I'm sorry no matter how you look at it, it is a townhome, it is not a home. Townhomes most of the times are purchased by a first time buyer who is just trying to get into something other than an apartment because they don't want that community apartment to start off their family or until they have enough money to start their own home. There was a house, a historical house that did sit on that exact lot 120 years it sat on that lot. There's people that actually come down to St. Rose out of Kenner, Metairie, Jefferson just to ride River Road to see these historical homes. Unfortunately the original owner who owned that home his wife passed away and he had to move to Mississippi with his son. So he wound up selling the property which a young couple did purchase that property and it did not sit with just no one owning the property like they had said before. The property was purchased by a couple who again was going to put a home there. They were actually going through the plans, they even talked to my son in law who is a contractor, ok, so they also talked to Mr. Charlie back here who does flooring work so they had every intention on building a single dwelling home with their young son. Unfortunately their mom passed away, they wound up moving into the parents home and they put the lot up for sale. They couldn't decide what they wanted to do with it, if they were going to wind up keeping it for their young son or if they were going to sell the lot and they decided to sell the lot and that's how Mr. Martin acquired the lot but it did not ever sit without an owner owning it with plans to do something with it as far as a single family dwelling. So I don't want this to be a misunderstanding that this lot just sat vacant and nobody was going to do anything with it and it was up for sale. And that agent back there that spoke, she should have known that, she should have already known that the property was purchased by an individual. Again the reason for us not wanting the townhomes and asking, let me go back, the last meeting we had how many times did Mr. Martin bring up all the homes he's built in our area, hey why all of a sudden do you want to put a townhome, a fourplex, whatever you want to call it on our street which is nothing but residential and has always been there since Riverview was established back in the '80's and we followed the structure of that same house that sat for 120 years. I don't get it how he comes to the conclusion that we're just going to accept the townhomes and again when he purchased and we came to that first meeting on April 4th he didn't own that property still, the dragons did. Again he knew that there was a conflict with him putting these townhomes out here but he still proceeded to go ahead with it. I also have the petition and we have more signatures, I sent everyone of yall one and I can give it to Michael again. Also I have his letter that came out to us, well not me, not the neighbors that live across from the actual property but to the neighbors in the back, stating that he's ready to build these homes, really? Did yall say something? Does he know something we don't know already? Was this already approved and we really don't need to be here? I don't get how he can send out a letter telling people that he's going to build luxury townhomes at 10990 River Road, really? I didn't know it was approved yet. Again, this is a special permit asking you today to leave it zoned the way it is, it's zoned as residential/transitional CR-1, leave it that way, leave it that way. He says he wants to build there was a mention of possibly a gas station or possibly a nursing home, wow this must be really small because again if he'd read what the Planning and Zoning instructions are it can only be 500 sq. ft. and I want to give this to you too. I just don't get this. Again I want to bring up about the townhomes. It is a proven fact townhomes don't hold their market value. Yeah he might get what he gets in the beginning because they're new everybody likes new, I like new too but guess what usually townhomes where they don't have an HOA fee, what happens, you have an owner that owns each individual space, one can afford it, one can't, one lost their job what happens? They can't keep up the outside, what happens to that? It goes downhill and then the next thing you know they're ready to start selling, the person who can afford it is ready to sell because look at how deplorable next door looks next to my clean area, that's what they say and that's where renters wind up coming in and it's happened. Look at Charlestown for #1, look at Kenner, look at Destrehan back on Brandon Hall, I mean come on those

were all nice townhomes at one time too now they can't hardly sell them. So you're going to let this man put these townhomes in our area and what's going to happen to us? We're going to lose property value that we worked hard for all our lives to get where we are just like you today. I know everybody up here has worked hard for their home and I just feel like yall are going to take it away from us now if you pass this special permit, leave the permit zoned the way it is. And another question I have is has there been a study of drainage here yet? No but we're going to pass a permit that we haven't even done a drainage special on, a study on. You know how can you pass something that hasn't even, that he just shows us a bunch of pictures and says I'm going to put this on the lot. Crime? Yeah townhouses bring crime. Charlestown, I hate to keep bringing up that neighborhood but it's our #1 crime right there in Charlestown. When I moved out here there were horse stables behind us, I knew that, I wanted that house still. I knew Charlestown was where it was, I still wanted my house on Riverview. I didn't buy my house and put all my money and invest it in everything that we have had to wind up with that. There again talk about traffic you're talking two just like the lady before that winds up being eight cars, could possibly be twelve depending on if the people that live there have teenage kids. Wow we can't handle the traffic we have up there already. Again it needs to be a single dwelling home and I have another question and I apologize because you know I got plenty of questions, the address is 10990 River Road, why are they facing Riverview? I mean I'm just asking why? The house that sat there faced River Road. Why does he get to put his townhomes facing and causing more traffic, more parking issues to us that have been there for years and again single dwelling home. I don't think I'm asking too much from you guys, I really don't, again I'm asking yall to relook at this reevaluate this and to please, please vote this down again like you did the first time. Nothing has changed with that permit. I thought that in order for us to come forth again, for him to reapply, there had to be a change, there's no change because I did contact Chris and there is no change. He's just reapplying because Mr. Booth isn't sitting there which was our third vote when we voted the last time, that's all I have to say.

Bob Rounds, 93 Riverview Drive. I don't think I can say much more than what's already been said other than I oppose it. The one thing in Mr. Martin's picture is not the big shadow on my house because I'm right next door to the property. Thank you.

Commissioner Frangella: Alright this is an open hearing 2019-6-SPU is anyone here to speak for or against? Name and address please ma'am.

Eileen Kelly, 92 Riverview Drive, St. Rose. When we first saw the signs go up asking permission I would assume to put what he wants to put there, the neighborhood is actually a mile long, I walked it and my husband did the thing on the car, it's a mile long and that's a lot of traffic going back and forth and when you have cars that have to sit on the curb it makes it harder to drive in that area. My husband and his neighbor took the signatures, one on each side of the neighborhood and all the way down and everyone that was home signed it and was against having the townhouse built. Everyone believes it's more townhouse apartments rather than townhouse because eventually it might get to that and that's what we don't want. We would like it to be single dwelling as it is now and also I was thinking if he did do that they would probably have to put the 6 ft. fence up somewhere and allow the traffic from those houses but that's a lot of people that would have to buy those dwellings and it's hard to sell a house in a bad economy much less sell those if the economy gets worse and for someone to come in and want to buy the property that's fine let them build a single dwelling house you can still make money doing that but this is not the neighborhood that wants it and if those signs went up to ask permission well then we say no and we would like to be heard and the last time we had a vote on it, it didn't pass. So we're all wondering why letters are sent out stating that they're actually going to do it then they're still having to vote on it again. How many times do we have to come back and say that we disapprove of it? How many times we have to tell you that we don't want it, we don't approve of it and why even put the sign on there if it's a done deal in other words. I don't believe it's a done deal and I would hope that no one was bribed, not that I want to, it can happen, it can happen. We're just very, very, very opposed and we want to make that crystal clear so that we don't have anyone saying that they didn't know how we really felt. We are all very, very concerned and upset and we want to make our voices heard so that you know before you make

any votes that we love our neighborhood, we love our neighbors and we don't want to see it change because you have to change the permit. So don't let it change, let it stay as it is for single dwellings and thank you for your time.

Commissioner Frangella: Name and address for the record please ma'am.

Hello my name is Marilyn Bellock the Councilwoman for the 5<sup>th</sup> District, St. Rose. I live at 251 Riverview Drive and it's actually Riverview Estates. I've been there for 30 years, probably 31 years, closer to 31 years. Even though I'm all the way to the end of Riverview about 5 homes away from where you get to the railroad tracks, it's a great neighborhood, it's an awesome neighborhood, that's why I've been there that long. We've had minor issues with robberies and break ins, but they were minor, nothing huge. So my reason for speaking is to inform the people I wanted the people to know the truth about what's going on here. I've been getting a lot of phone calls and I've been getting a lot of emails and people meeting me on the street and people knocking at my door and all kinds of things saying that they do not want townhomes. So my very next question was you do know if you don't get townhomes something is coming there because it's zoned C-1. So 6-10 of these properties on Riverview will be directly affected, they get to look at whatever's going to be there every day, a lot of us are in the back we have to come to the front to actually see whatever is going to be there but I just didn't want them to say they didn't want townhomes and get something else and be upset with the situation so my job as councilwoman was to tell them that, to make them aware of what's going on. But I did stand up to say that Ms. Smith stated that Mr. Billy Booth was kicked off and replaced and all that, we all know that is not true, he termed out and it was my right to put somebody in that position for District 5 and I had never had that opportunity. So when my time came when he termed out is the reason Mr. Michael Dunn was placed there, no other reason, he termed out. So my job is to represent my community as District 5 representative so I'm here today to let you know they said they would rather anything else other than townhomes so I stand before you to let you know if they don't want townhomes, I don't want townhomes, it's as simple as that. Now this is really unprecedented for a council person to have to come to this meeting and yall know that to come and say something but it was so many people that didn't want this and all kinds of things were going around the neighborhood so I figured I'd show up just to disperse that, it's as simple as that. Thank you.

Now that the Councilwoman has speak I will speak, may I?

Commissioner Frangella: Applicant? Yes.

Mr. Martin: When we first got started with this and actually the letter that went out in the mail, I was actually told to put the letter out in the mail by the Councilwoman. She said that the petition that was in the first one that they persuaded them to do because they told them it was Section 8, was wrong and uninformative for the record.

Commissioner Frangella: Order

Mr. Martin: So we did just that, we sent letters to the people that signed the petition to inform them that it was not Section 8, to educate them on what was there. I know through a cousin of mine that's in the group of the dismissal here, that if this Councilwoman didn't take the podium today, that they were going to vote to try to oust her. So that would give her an incentive to stand before this mic today and remove all of the hard work that we've done as she's suggested, getting a picture, informing the people, getting all the research we've done without nobody telling us we were going to get approved or not, but everything we were told, consulting the police when we told them they had to get off our property they started maliciously parking in front of the property on the street. The police officers started telling them you can't park on their property but you can park on the street. Why? Because at Ormond Meadows where there are townhomes built within the community right now on the market, appraised and pending sale for \$268,000 on the street and they're others on the River Road all combined appraise for more. I guess when you're doing the right thing and you're asked to do the right thing and you do it and all the hard work you feel undermined that's the only reason I'm taking this podium again, the only reason I'm taking it. The guy says our view, if I put a two-story commercial building it affects your view, if I put a two-story house there, if affects your view. He says the lady at 93 and I really didn't want to say this because I love the lady she's very nice, but the fact remains you go on that street right now there's a truck that the police have in their records that he don't even live there, he's got a rack full of crab traps that's been in the back of that truck forever, you don't believe me, check the police report. It's commercial, it's been zoned commercial, it's easy to say we want whatever goes up there, we know that's not the truth guys. They put a rehab center there, they put another drug store, they don't want that, it's easy to say that right now, right now when you have to make this decision right now and then the next time they're going to be putting up a sign saying we don't want it but guess what nobody has the right to put up a sign there, it just goes up, it just goes up and they're saying that right now in the moment. This is life, this is life here.

Commissioner Frangella: Excuse me Mr. Martin, can we have order in this room.

Mr. Martin: I was asked and here goes some more truth from my cousin who was aligned with them, he told me all the malicious things they were doing, he even backed off on it and said it was wrong. He knew they were parking in front there so my guy couldn't cut the grass. The code guy came out there and while he was out there asking them to move I hurried up and went paid the guy \$50 to cut the grass because they were maliciously parking in front the property. The truth of the matter is if you look at these pictures, this is what it looks like and this is what they want to do on the property. This is what we want to do as we speak, on Ormond Meadows in Destrehan. The lady, she's not here tonight and I told her really don't come, she wanted to come and state how the lifestyle of parking there, when they have their picnics, it's fun to have the picnics. All that is good right now and I understand the Councilwoman, that's a hard bargain, you got to stay on the street with them and you got to be voted back into the seat? Well that's not right, I expected her to be neutral like she said she would be neutral, not trying to come hurt us. I'm done.

Sara Catalanato, 235 Riverview Drive. When the petition came down the street for everyone to sign if they were opposed to it, nothing was ever said about it being for sure that it was going to be Section 8 and that's why he was getting signatures, nobody said anything about it being Section 8 housing. We all don't want the townhomes even if you live at the back of the street, you have to drive pass it every day. Nothing was done maliciously, no one's going to threaten to vote her out if she votes with us, it's her home too. We've all lived there 30 years or more. I'm opposed to it as well just like everyone else.

Commissioner Frangella: Order. Anyone else here to speak? State your name and address for the record.

Milton Alleman, Hahnville. Two months ago I was sitting in this chamber to address this board on a totally separate issue dealing with drainage and infrastructure in the Hahnville area, when I heard a small group of people pleading with this board to hear their concerns on something that they don't want in their neighborhood and I make the same statement all the time, zoning should be fairly simple but it never is and tonight is another example because the issue was done and now we're redoing it. There may be a reason for that that I'm not aware of but that's fine. But what you have to remember is and I keep saying this and Mr. Albert and everybody before him heard me say this, zoning is to protect you from your neighbor and your neighbor from you. These folks couldn't have said it any better, everyone is telling you, they are asking this board to provide them with some protection. All they're looking for is to maintain the integrity of their subdivision, they like the idea that it's single family dwellings and that's what they want to maintain. Maybe part of the problem is that our Planning and Zoning Department over the years has went about rezoning properties that maybe are in error and Mr. Albert will agree with me on this, our Future Land Use Map, it's a good guideline but it has a lot of problems, then they want to bring up the problems with drainage and if you've read this document like I'm sure you all have, the concern from drainage generates from the dollar store next door. So they're asking the developer and I'm sure Mr. Martin does fine work, I'm not here to debate that and I'm not here to call names and threaten people and none of that, but they're going to ask Mr. Martin and

why Mr. Martin the whole subdivision to help drain the problem they got with the dollar store. I'm sure if yall are following what's going on in our parish, we're presently working on code upgrades for our subdivision rules that will not allow one developer to drain onto another and that may be exactly what happens here, so that's a serious problem. But it all boils down to and we love this in St. Charles Parish, quality of life. They want you all to protect them, they want to maintain their quality of life, they love their little God's Green Acres if you will and they want to keep it, they want to keep what they have. Our Planning and Zoning Department if you read their guidelines and what they do, they become an advocate for developers, they work with developers to enhance, what's the words they use here, physical development of our parish, economical development, so their job ends up being advocate for the developers. Do you know who the advocate for the residents and the citizens, this board. So I plead with you, this board, to take into account what they're telling you. Please protect their rights in St. Charles Parish. Thank you.

Commissioner Frangella: Order. This is an open hearing 2019-6-SPU.

George Vance, 245 Riverview Drive, St. Rose since 1989. I love St. Charles Parish, don't like what's happening to it in certain instances like this. When I first moved into the parish I loved it and I do see some developing going on that doesn't look like it should have transpired but this hasn't happened yet so we can stop it before it does and maintain our street as a residential single family units, I think that would be best for the street. Thank you.

Hello my name is Tammy and I live at 92 Riverview Drive. My parents also live there, Tim and Eileen Kelly, they both spoke. I actually reside in 2 homes, one also in Destrehan, La, where Ormond Meadows is located. My parents live directly across from the property that he would like to build these townhomes and like they said they had an old nice plantation style home that was there for 120 years, it was beautiful, it was right next to the levee, right next to the river, it had a very southern feel to it. It was very nice and the front of the neighborhood had pecan trees as well, I have lived there 30 years of my life, my entire life and the townhomes going up I can guarantee will lower the property values there and I have throughout the years have been shopping for homes and I noticed that townhomes cost less, they have lots of remodeling issues that don't get addressed and from my perspective when you own single family home you take pride in your home and if you need to remodel and update it you will. When you're in a townhome you're in a smaller space, sorry I get nervous, when you're in a smaller space and you need to do updating and your life has progressed to the point that you can move out of that smaller space as opposed to remodeling, you do, you move to a bigger space, you don't remodel and the property value goes lower and lower and I feel like that's what happens with townhomes, I could be wrong but who knows but I don't believe that these townhomes belong on Riverview Drive and as my father pointed out, if it's a two story home and it has a little bit of attic space there, it's going to be a three story home, there's not a single three story home on Riverview Drive, we have two, twostory homes but if you put that huge structure at the front of the neighborhood, my parents live at the front, I have a thirteen month old daughter I bring her to my mom to babysit and spend time there, there's already traffic issues there. When I come in I get nervous because there is not much visibility and if you put these huge structures there it's going to further inhibit the visibility and at that point it's going to be a safety issue. Sorry. At that point if you create a bigger safety issue the parish might be liable for approving this huge structure because if I get in a car accident I'm going to want to blame somebody because I can't see anything. I'm going to let you know right now I'm going to be upset especially if my daughter my daughter gets hurt and she's thirteen months old, it's going to be bad. So these huge things don't belong there, nobody wants them there, the street has come together, it's beautiful, everybody loves each other on the street, everybody standing together and nobody wants this and I'm going to let you know right now the safety issue up there if you add an extra four, five, six, seven, eight cars no one is going to have room to park and all that grass in front, they're right, it's not going to be there, it's just going to be cement. Townhomes when you have cement and you have cars you're going to have zero landscaping and the point of owning a home and owning a little bit of property in the world is you want it to look nice and when you have a townhome and you have no grass where are you going to put your bushes,

where are you going to put your flowers? It's not going to be that beautiful, the trees, there are no trees, they're going to have to plant a little seed, maybe 20 now to have a tree that big. There's no grass, the entire front of the neighborhood is going to look like an apartment community like Charlestown does. In Ormond Meadows because I live in Destrehan too as well as St. Rose and I've grown up and went to Destrehan High School, it is one of the lower value areas in Destrehan and in Destrehan you have homes that are \$1M + and you have homes that are \$400,000, there are homes that are \$300,000, his little \$200,000 townhomes is not a home that anybody wants to live in in Destrehan. Destrehan has amazing schools, amazing low crime rates so for those townhomes to hold that value it is only because it's in Destrehan with the great schools and low crime rate. If you put those same townhomes in St. Rose it's not going to hold the same value. So those \$200,000 townhomes will not be a \$200,000 townhome in St. Rose because of those multi-million dollar houses next to them. I tell you right now no one wants to live in those townhomes when they have a choice to live in a single family unit. My dad also wanted me to mention that the townhomes on Ormond Meadows are all the way on the back of the street where they don't have these big structures in the front of the street like you would be doing to Riverview Estates that there are multifamily homes on Ormond Meadows but they are in the back and they're away from the visible forefront. If you put these in the visible forefront of Riverview Estates you will be changing the entire face of it and no one wants that. So please vote no. Thank you.

Commissioner Frangella: Once again open hearing for 2019-6-SPU anyone to speak for or against? Hearing is closed. Any questions?

Commissioner Petit: Chris if you can answer this, looking at the driveways, the width of the driveways on the site plan are quite different than the rendering so vehicles would have to park side by side? Is that 18 ft. of concrete in the front?

Mr. Welker: Yes, they're showing as 18 ft. wide, we're not reviewing the rendering we're reviewing the site plan.

Commissioner Petit: The site plan is more accurate?

Mr. Welker: Yes

Commissioner Petit: So vehicles would have to park side by side and there's not space between the two driveways.

Mr. Welker: No there is no, it's designed so that the driveway leading up to each garage are side by side to each unit so it looks like each unit will have an 18 ft. wide driveway

Commissioner Granier: I'd like to kind of reiterate what the Council lady said from St. Rose but I want to read what's allowed in a CR-1 zone just to make sure everybody really understands what that is because I heard what all the residents said about protecting that neighborhood to be a neighborhood and everything that is allowed meaning he could build tomorrow and never come to anybody to ask permission, nobody, he could build it tomorrow. Sell it to somebody that want to build it tomorrow. Here's a list: office buildings, is there any limit to stories? No limit to the stories for office buildings. Branch banks and branch savings and loans, he could build it tomorrow. Personal service shops, beauty shops, barber shops, small schools, studios, antique shops, yall do understand that can be built on that property if someone owns it and not need a special use permit.

Commissioner Galliano: The first time you came up I got to apologize I didn't do my homework, I didn't ride in front the property I looked at on a map like we normally do but since then I've drove down the street, I've drove in front the property, I drove in front of Mr. Martin's townhomes, they're very, very nice townhomes, they are well done. I'm going to go and say that he can do a lot more aggressive things with this property that would increase the traffic tremendously. I got to say I think, you know I kinda changed my opinion from the first time we did this and I don't know Mr. Martin at all but he does a very good product and I think it's one of the least evasive things he can do with that land.

Commissioner Frangella: Any other?

Commissioner Gordon: I have a question. First of all I want to ask Mr. Martin at any point did you think about building a single family home on that lot?

Mr. Martin: It's zoned commercial.

Commissioner Gordon: It's residential/commercial. Again to the residents are you sure, are you comfortable if Mr. Martin leaves from here today and tomorrow he builds a beauty shop are you ok with that traffic?

Mr. Albert: It's just a rhetorical question.

Commissioner Gordon: Just a general question asking if he leaves away today, a beauty shop can go there, a bank as Trey stated. So are you comfortable with having a beauty shop and what Trey mentioned versus residential.

Commissioner Frangella: My question is and I'm confused by this drawing because what I see in here is all of the houses at the beginning of the road are CR-1 correct, based on what's here?

Mr. Welker: Yes.

Commissioner Frangella: So you can build a residential house on that property

Mr. Albert: Single family homes require a special permit use similar to this process.

Commissioner Frangella: So the lot can be subdivided and he build two homes correct?

Mr. Albert: yes

Commissioner Frangella: Thank you. Any other questions?

Commissioner Dunn: I'm going to apologize to the public as well as Mr. Martin and I'm going to ask for us to table it tonight, I apologize. What yall need to understand I was given the minutes yesterday, a few people had contacted me, I haven't really talked to a lot of people, I hadn't talked to Mr. Martin and he hasn't had time to talk to me so I haven't been able to sit down and get all my facts together in order to make a decision. I'm asking to table and I understand yall have been through a lot, I understand Mr. Martin's been through a lot but I'd really like to see us table it in order for me to make a fair decision to everybody. Bring it up at the next meeting, I'll be able to make the vote and I'll have enough information in order to do it.

Mr. Albert: You need a second on a motion to take action on it.

Commissioner Gordon: I'll second it

Commissioner Frangella: Call for a vote on the motion.

YEAS: Gordon, Dunn, Galliano

NAYS: Petit, Granier, Richard, Frangella

ABSENT: None

Commissioner Frangella: Motion fails. So now we'll go on and vote.

YEAS: Gordon, Granier, Richard, Galliano

NAYS: Petit, Dunn Frangella

ABSENT: None

Commissioner Frangella: Motion passes

Mr. Albert: I believe that the public is going to want to hear this. There will be another vote on this on July 1<sup>st</sup>.